ECOPHYSIOLOGICAL TRAITS EXPLAIN SPECIES DOMINANCE PATTERNS IN MACROALGAL BLOOMS¹

Heike K. Lotze^{2,3} and Winfrid Schramm

Institut für Meereskunde, Düsternbrooker Weg 20, 24105 Kiel, Germany

Macroalgal blooms are a growing environmental problem in eutrophic coastal ecosystems world wide. These blooms are dominated typically by only one out of several co-occurring opportunistic species, which are all favored by increased nutrient loads. We asked whether pronounced dominance of filamentous Pilayella littoralis Kjellm. (Phaeophyceae) over foliose Enteromorpha intestinalis L. (Chlorophyceae) in the Baltic Sea can be explained by interspecific physiological differences. In laboratory experiments, we analyzed uptake kinetics of nitrate, ammonium, and phosphate and the time dependency of uptake rates for both species. We further examined growth rates and nutrient assimilation in relation to single and combined enrichment with nitrate and phosphate, and three different nitrogen sources. Overall, we did not detect distinct differences in uptake, growth, and assimilation rates between P. littoralis and E. intestinalis. Minor differences and the related advantages for single species are discussed. Highest maximal uptake rates were found for ammonium, followed by nitrate and phosphate. Strong time dependency of uptake occurred, with the highest rates during the first 15 to 30 min. Nitrate enrichment had far more of an effect on growth than phosphate. Enrichment with urea, ammonium, and nitrate significantly increased growth rates without interspecific differences. A larger surface area to volume (SA/V) ratio in Pilayella compared with Enteromorpha did not translate into greater physiological capacity. We conclude that species dominance patterns in macroalgal blooms are not always a direct result of different ecophysiological traits among species. Ecological traits such as susceptibility to herbivory are important factors in determining species distribution in the field.

Key index words: Enteromorpha; eutrophication; functional form; growth; nutrient source; *Pilayella*; surface area to volume ratio; time dependency; tissue content; uptake kinetics

Abbreviations: $K_{\rm m}$, half-saturation constant; RGR, relative growth rate; SA/V, surface area to volume; $V_{\rm max}$, maximal uptake rate; α , initial slope ($V_{\rm max}/K_{\rm m}$)

In recent decades, increasing cultural eutrophication has changed the structure and diversity of marine benthic communities (Ryther and Dunstan 1971, Raffaelli et al. 1989, Nixon 1990, Duarte 1995, Schories et al. 1997). Most visibly, mass blooms of opportunistic fast-growing species now occur frequently in eutrophic coastal waters worldwide (Cederwall and Elmgren 1990, Bonsdorff 1992, Schramm and Nienhuis 1996, Raffaelli et al. 1998). These macroalgal blooms are generally explained by increased nutrient loads which selectively favor filamentous and foliose macroalgae because of their physiological traits (Larsson et al. 1985, Duarte 1995, Pedersen and Borum 1996, Raffaelli et al. 1998). Characterized by high rates of nutrient uptake, photosynthesis, and growth, these opportunistic species gain competitive advantage over the perennial, late-successional vegetation in the course of increasing nutrient loading (Wallentinus 1978, 1984, Sand-Jensen and Borum 1991, Duarte 1995). Moreover, the high tolerance of opportunists to changes in salinity, temperature, light, and dissolved oxygen levels enhances the success of these algae in eutrophic estuaries and lagoons, which are often characterized by highly fluctuating abiotic conditions (Peckol et al. 1994, Peckol and Rivers 1995a, Fong et al. 1996, Raffaelli et al. 1998). In many coastal areas, macroalgal blooms are dominated by one or two green algal species of the genera Enteromorpha, Ulva, Cladophora, or Chaetomorpha (overview in Fletcher 1996, Raffaelli et al. 1998). Distinct differences in physiological capacity or tolerance may explain dominance patterns among cooccurring opportunistic species as suggested by the few existing attempts that have been made to test this hypothesis (Lavery and McComb 1991, Lotze 1994, Peckol and Rivers 1995b, Fong et al. 1996). Still, our ability to predict species dominance among bloom-forming macroalgae is slight (Raffaelli et al. 1998).

In contrast to the common dominance of green tides (Fletcher 1996), the filamentous brown alga *Pilayella littoralis* dominates mass blooms over co-occurring *E. intestinalis* in many parts of the Baltic Sea (Wallentinus 1984, Kruk-Dowgiallo 1991, Norkko and Bonsdorff 1996, Kiirikki and Lehvo 1997, Lotze et al. 1999). This dominance of *P. littoralis* cannot be related to different productivity levels over a range of temperature and light conditions, despite advantageous germination of *P. littoralis* at lower temperatures (Lotze et al. 1999). Furthermore, productivity levels of both species are not reduced in brackish conditions (Bolton 1979, Reed and Russell 1979).

In this paper, we asked whether distinct differences in nutrient use and preference between the two bloom-

¹ Received 13 June 1999. Accepted 15 November 1999.

² Author for reprint requests; e-mail hlotze@ifm.uni-kiel.de.

³ Present address and address for correspondence: Biology Department, Dalhousie University, Halifax, Nova Scotia, Canada, B3H 4J1; e-mail hlotze@is.dal.ca.

forming macroalgae P. littoralis and E. intestinalis may explain the dominance of the former in the Baltic Sea. Pilayella littoralis, with its filamentous, highly branched thalli, has a greater SA/V ratio than the foliose E. intestinalis (Nielsen and Sand-Jensen 1990). Because increased SA/V ratio is generally thought to translate into higher productivity levels (Rosenberg and Ramus 1984, Duke et al. 1989, Carpenter 1990), we tested whether greater surface area in P. littoralis translates into greater nutrient uptake and growth rates compared with E. intestinalis. In laboratory experiments, we studied (1) timedependent uptake kinetics of ammonium, nitrate, and phosphate; (2) growth rates in relation to enrichment with different nitrogen sources (ammonium, nitrate, urea), as well as interactions in a combined enrichment with nitrate and phosphate; and (3) assimilation rates of N and P during the growth experiments.

MATERIALS AND METHODS

Plant material and field site. Adult thalli of Pilayella littoralis and Enteromorpha intestinalis were collected in the outer Schlei Fjord (lat 54°41'N, long 10°0'E), Western Baltic Sea, Germany. Here, the perennial vegetation, consisting of Fucus vesiculosus L., Potamogeton pectinatus L., and Zostera marina L., becomes overgrown regularly in spring and summer by epiphytic P. littoralis and to a lesser extent by E. intestinalis. In 1995, maximum biomass of Pi*layella* and *Enteromorpha* was 16 and 1.4 $g \cdot m^{-2}$ dry weight basis, respectively (Lotze et al. 1999). Winter nutrient concentrations in 1995 reached maxima of 160 µM nitrate N, 12 µM ammonium N, and 2 µM phosphate P; minimum summer concentrations in nitrate and ammonium varied between undetectable and 0.3 µM; in phosphate, between 0.1 and 0.6 µM (Schramm et al. 1996). Nutrient supply at the field site varies greatly on a time scale of hours to days because of wind-driven water exchanges with either nutrient-rich water from the inner, highly eutrophic Schlei Fjord or comparatively nutrient-poor water from the adjacent Kiel Bight (Schramm et al. 1996). We collected fresh plant material 1 day prior to our laboratory experiments in June 1995, when both species were abundant in the field and previously observed high epiphytic diatom loads on Pilayella had disappeared (Lotze 1998). Thus, a possible confounding of physiological properties from the epiphytic diatoms was avoided. Algal thalli were then kept in 20-L tanks filled with freshly collected and 0.2-µm filtered seawater from the field site. Tanks were illuminated by fluorescent light tubes at 100 $\mu mol \; photon \cdot m^{-2} \cdot s^{-1}$ in a 14 h light:10 h dark cycle at 15° C.

Growth rate and nutrient assimilation. In June 1995, nutrient effects on growth rates of E. intestinalis and P. littoralis were tested over a 12-day period in a batch mode experiment. Nutrient-enriched media were replaced every 2 days. Levels of nutrient enrichment were chosen as high, short-time pulse concentrations that were about five times greater than maximum winter concentrations measured in the outer Schlei (see above). These high nutrient levels represented nutrient pulses occurring through (1) wind-driven water exchange, (2) flux from the sediment, and (3) increased land runoff after a rainfall (Riisgard et al. 1995, Fong et al. 1996, Schramm et al. 1996). In the first experiment, thalli of Enteromorpha and Pilayella were exposed to single and combined enrichment with nitrate and phosphate. Enrichment concentrations correspond to 500 µM nitrate N (as NaNO₃) and 30 µM phosphate P (as KH₂PO₄). A treatment without enrichment served as a control. Compared with the control treatment with a background N:P ratio of 43:1, P was added in surplus to the enrichment treatment (N:P ratio of 16.6:1) to avoid P limitation during the experiment. To test effects of other nitrogen sources in a second parallel experiment, we enriched treatments with 50 μ M ammonium N (as NH₄Cl), and 10 μ M urea N (=5 μ M $CO(NH_2)_2$). To prevent P limitation in these treatments, 30 μ M

phosphate P (as KH₂PO₄) was added. Each treatment was started in five replicates, with a standard algal weight of 0.1 g wet weight in 750 mL freshly collected, 0.2-µm filtered seawater with nutrients added from stock solutions. Algal wet weight was determined in a standardized procedure with a specially constructed centrifuge, operating as a spin dryer to remove adherent water for 30 s with constant rotation speed. Background seawater levels were 0.09 µM phosphate P, 3.49 µM nitrate N, 0.80 µM ammonum N, and 0.61 µM urea N. All tests were run at 15° C, 100 µmol photon·m⁻²·s⁻¹ in a 14 h light:10 h dark cycle. After 12 days, algal material was reweighed and relative growth rates were calculated: RGR = (ln $w_1 - \ln w_2)/(t_2 - t_1)$, where *w* is wet weight and *t* is time.

After the growth experiment, three randomly chosen replicates per treatment were used to analyze C–N–P tissue content of treated algae and compared with those of untreated algae. Algal thalli were dried for 48 h at 70° C for dry weight determination. Afterwards, C–N content of dried material was determined using a C/N Analyzer (Fisons Instruments, NA 1500 N). For the analysis of P content, dried algal material was combusted (550° C for 2 h), eluted with 5 mL H₂O and 0.1 mL H₂SO₄ (4.5 n) and then PO₄–P was photometrically analyzed with an autoanalyzer using the methods of Grasshoff et al. (1986).

Statistical analysis was performed by three-way ANOVA (factors: species, nitrate, and phosphate, $2 \times 2 \times 2$) and two-way ANOVA (factors: species and nitrogen source, 2×2) with RGR and tissue N and P content as the dependent variables. Untransformed data met the assumption of homogeneity of variances (Cochran's Test). Relative effect size of the experimental factors was calculated as omega-squared for a fixed-factor model and transformed to the percentage of explained variance (Howell 1992). Linear regression analyses were performed to check for linear correlations between RGR and N content versus molar N concentration in different nitrogen enrichments.

Nutrient uptake. Nutrient uptake was studied with three different nutrient sources: nitrate, ammonium, and phosphate. We used a combination of the perturbation and the multiple flask methods as recommended by Pedersen (1994). While the multiple flask incubation with different substrate concentrations and short incubation time is the best method for estimation of initial uptake, the combination with the perturbation method provides important information on the time dependency of nutrient uptake (Harrison et al. 1989, Pedersen 1994). Because of the transient nature of nitrogen uptake, the Michaelis-Menten equation is inadequate to describe the entire uptake kinetics, but can be applied when uptake rates are obtained over analogous time intervals (Pedersen 1994). Time intervals and concentrations used in the following experiments were chosen according to the results of a pilot study (unpublished data). Uptake experiments with nitrate (NaNO₃) and ammonium (NH₄Cl) were started with initial N concentrations of 0, 5, 10, 20, 50, 100, 200, and 500 µM. To avoid P shortage of nitrogen uptake (Björnsäter and Wheeler 1990), all experiments received a precautionary phosphate addition of 3 µM. Uptake rates were followed by analyzing nitrate concentrations in the media at 0, 30, 60, 120, and 180 min in the nitrate experiment and ammonium at 0, 15, 30, 45, 60, and 120 min in the ammonium experiment. The phosphate uptake experiment was started with initial phosphate-P concentrations of 0, 3, 6, 12, 18, and 30 μ M (KH₂PO₄), and an additional 50 µM nitrate N and 50 µM ammonium N, and was sampled at 0, 60, 120, and 240 min. Uptake rates measured with this experimental design represent transient responses to nutrient pulses with surge uptake during the first time intervals and assimilation uptake during the later time intervals, and should be distinguished from acclimated (steady state) uptake rates measured in continuous culture. We chose this approach to detect differences between Enteromorpha and Pilayella in their rapid response (minutes to hours) to nutrient pulses, whereas their responses over a longer time scale (12 days) were investigated in our growth experiments.

Freshly collected and 0.2-µm filtered seawater was used for

the uptake experiments with corresponding background nutrient levels of 0.54 µM phosphate P, 0.41 µM nitrate N, and 0.56 µM ammonium N. Nutrient concentrations in seawater samples were determined with a continuous flow analyzer using the methods of Grasshoff et al. (1986). All uptake tests were run at 15° C and 200 µmol photon m⁻²·s⁻¹ between 1200 and 1500 hours. Nitrate and ammonium uptake rates were determined in 1-L sterilized glass bottles, phosphate uptake was determined in 1-L sterilized PETG (polyethylene terephthalate copolyester, Nalgene) bottles because of phosphate absorption by glass. For adaptation of algae to experimental conditions, we filled beakers with 1 L of 0.2-µm filtered seawater and added 1 g wet weight (entire, freshly collected thalli) 2 hours in advance. Aeration provided continual mixing of the medium. After this adaptive period, we removed the algal thalli carefully with a sieve, added nutrients from a concentrated stock solution, mixed carefully, took the first nutrient sample (1 mL) with an Eppendorf pipette (using 1 tip per sample), and put the algae back into the beaker. Nutrient samples were diluted and analyzed immediately with an autoanalyzer. After final sampling, algae were dried for 48 h at 70° C for dry weight determination. In each uptake experiment, a control without algal material and with additions of 100 µM nitrate N or ammonium N or 12 µM phosphate P was run. No autogenic changes in substrate concentrations were detected over the experimental period.

Uptake rates (V) were calculated from changes in substrate concentrations during each sampling interval as μ mol·h⁻¹·g⁻¹ dry weight: $V = [(S_0 \times vol_0) - (S_t \times vol_t)]/(t \times w)$, where S_0 is the actual substrate concentration at the beginning and S_t at the end of a sampling interval, vol_0 is the water volume at the beginning and vol_t at the end of a sampling interval, t is the time of the sampling interval and w is the algal biomass as grams dry weight. Uptake rates were plotted against S_0 for each time interval separately and fitted to the Michaelis–Menten equation, $V = (V_{max} \times S_0)/(K_m + S_0)$, using nonlinear least-squares regression (we used the Marquardt–Levenberg algorithm; the process is iterative). This provided estimates of V_{max} (maximum uptake rate) and K_m (half-saturation constant), which allowed calculation of α (initial slope = V_{max}/K_m).

RESULTS

Growth rate and nutrient assimilation. In our growth experiments, all treatments with nitrogen enrichment significantly increased the growth rate of E. intestinalis and P. littoralis compared with the control treatments (Fig. 1), but no significant differences between the two species were detected (factor species, nitrate enrichment: $F_{1,16} = 2.037, P = 0.1727$; ammonium: $F_{1,16} = 0.223, P =$ 0.6432; urea: $F_{1,16} = 0.342$, P = 0.5671). Nitrate enrichment more than doubled growth rate ($F_{1,16} = 55.74, P =$ 0.0001) in Enteromorpha (2.1-fold) and Pilayella (2.4-fold). Ammonium enrichment resulted in 1.7- and 1.4-fold increases ($F_{1,16} = 7.46$, P = 0.0148), and urea enrichment in 1.6- and 1.3-fold increases ($F_{1,16} = 5.53$, P =0.0319) in growth rate of Enteromorpha and Pilayella, respectively. A regression analysis over the different nitrogen sources indicated a significant increase of RGR with increasing molar N concentration (F_{137} = $30.753, P = 0.0001, R^2 = 0.45$), but again there was no significant difference between the two species ($F_{1,37}$ = 0.20, P = 0.8876). Tissue N content was significantly enhanced by enrichment with nitrate ($F_{1,8} = 262, P = 0.0001$) and ammonium ($F_{1,8} = 19.4, P = 0.0023$), whereas urea enrichment caused a slight decrease in tissue N ($F_{1.8} = 6.3$, P = 0.0366). Regression analysis revealed a significant correlation between tissue N

content and molar N concentration in the medium $(F_{1,21} = 160, P = 0.0001, R^2 = 0.88)$ without interspecific difference $(F_{1,21} = 0.015, P = 0.9029)$. Phosphorus content remained unaffected (P > 0.3) by all nitrogen enrichment treatments and no interspecific differences occurred (P > 0.1 for all nitrogen sources).

In a combined enrichment experiment, no interaction between nitrate and phosphate enrichment was detected (N \times P, P = 0.0761; Table 1; Fig. 2). Nitrate enrichment had the main effect on growth rate, explaining 45% of variance without a significant difference between species (S \times N, P = 0.526). While growth of *Enteromorpha* was not affected by phosphate enrichment, phosphate slightly increased growth of *Pilayella*, indicated by a significant species \times phosphate interaction (S \times P, P = 0.0148). However, this interaction effect explained only 6.3% of the total variance (Table 1). Combined enrichment of nitrate and phosphate resulted in a 3.5-fold increase of RGR in *Pilayella* and a 1.6-fold increase in *Enteromorpha* (Fig. 2). After combined enrichment, however, maximal RGRs were not significantly different between species (t-test, $F_{1,32} = 1.858$, P = 0.1824). Tissue N content was significantly enhanced by nitrate enrichment ($F_{3,16}$ = 153, P = 0.0001), as well as tissue P by phosphate enrichment ($F_{3,16} = 14.2, P = 0.0001$), but no interspecific differences occurred (factor species, tissue N: $F_{1,16} = 3.219, P = 0.0917$; tissue P: $F_{1,16} = 0.864, P =$ 0.3663) (Fig. 2). Prior to the experiments, N contents were 1.44% (± 0.03 SE) of dry weight in *E. intestinalis* and 2.22% (± 0.03) in *P. littoralis*, P contents were 0.15% (± 0.01) and 0.25% (± 0.01) , respectively, resulting in



FIG. 1. Growth of adult thalli and tissue N assimilation of *Enteromorpha intestinalis* and *Pilayella littoralis* in relation to enrichment with different sources of nitrogen: nitrate N (500 μ M), ammonium N (50 μ M), urea N (10 μ M), and a control. Phosphate was enriched in all treatments (30 μ M). Relative growth rate per day (RGR·d⁻¹, ±1 SE, n = 5) was determined by increase of we weight after 12 d. Final tissue N content of *Enteromorpha* (open circles) and *Pilayella* (filled circles) are shown for each treatment (±1 SE, n = 3).

molar N:P ratios of 21 in *Enteromorpha* and 19 in *Pilayella*. After 12 days in combined N and P enrichments with media N:P ratios ranging from 0.1 to 5000, tissue N:P ratios ranged from 11.55 to 46.98 (Table 2).

Nutrient uptake. Nutrient uptake rates of E. intestinalis and P. littoralis following initial pulses of nitrate, ammonium, and phosphate were analyzed over several time intervals (Fig. 3). Overall, no distinct differences between the two species were detected in uptake rates of any nutrient tested, but minor differences occurred. Enteromorpha showed greater nitrate uptake in later time intervals (60-120, 120-180 min) compared with Pilayella (Fig. 3; Table 3). Ammonium uptake in the first 30 minutes was similar in both species, but Pilayella showed higher uptake rates in intermediate time intervals (30-45, 45-60 min). There were no distinct differences between species in phosphate uptake. Strong time dependency in the uptake of all three nutrients occurred, with $K_{\rm m}$ and $V_{\rm max}$ declining with increasing incubation time. Hence, values of α were highly variable and did not change consistently with time; the increase in α for nitrate uptake of *Pilayella* and the decrease in α for phosphate uptake of both species may be artifacts due to the high variability of both $K_{\rm m}$ and $V_{\rm max}$ values (Table 3). Surge uptake of ammonium during the first time interval was 7-fold greater than assimilation uptake during the last time interval in Enteromorpha and 8-fold greater in Pilayella. Surge uptake was 3- and 5-fold greater than the assimilation uptake for phosphate and 2.5- and 9-fold greater for nitrate in Enteromorpha and Pilayella, respectively.

The actual uptake data (Fig. 3, symbols) for all three nutrients showed distinct deviations from the Michaelis–Menten fit (Fig. 3, lines) in both species, especially in the early time intervals. Our data show a saturation level at lower concentrations than predicted by the Michaelis–Menten equation, and slightly reduced uptake rates at highest substrate concentrations.

DISCUSSION

Our results show that dominance patterns among opportunistic bloom-forming macroalgae are not always a direct result of different ecophysiological traits

TABLE 1. Results of 3-way ANOVA on single and combined effects of phosphate (30μ M) and nitrate (500μ M) enrichment on growth of adult thalli of *Enteromorpha intestinalis* and *Pilayella littoralis* (factor: species). Relative effect size is shown as explained variance in %.

Source of variation	df	${ m MS}_{ m 10^3} imes$	F-ratio	P-value	Variance (%)		
Species (S)	1	0.562	0.984	0.3287			
Nitrate (N)	1	23.771	41.623	0.0001	45.0		
Phosphate (P)	1	2.243	3.927	0.0562			
$S \times \dot{N}$	1	0.235	0.411	0.5260			
$S \times P$	1	3.789	6.634	0.0148	6.3		
$N \times P$	1	1.920	3.361	0.0761			
$S \times N \times P$	1	0.143	0.251	0.6199			
Residual	32	0.571					



FIG. 2. Growth of adult thalli and tissue N and P assimilation of *Enteromorpha intestinalis* and *Pilayella littoralis* in relation to single and combined enrichment with phosphate (30 μ M) and nitrate (500 μ M). Relative growth rate per day (RGR·d⁻¹, ±1 SE, n = 5) was determined by measuring increase of wet weight after 12 d. Final tissue N content (filled circles) and P content (open circles) are shown for each treatment (±1 SE, n = 3).

as reported from other studies (Fujita 1985, Lavery and McComb 1991, Lotze 1994, Peckol and Rivers 1995b, Fong et al. 1996). The co-occurring filamentous brown alga *Pilayella littoralis* and foliose green alga *Enteromorpha intestinalis* showed closely similar nutrient uptake, nutrient assimilation, and growth rates at various nutrient enrichment treatments. Surprisingly, distinct differences in thallus morphology and SA/V ratio between the two species did not translate into different physiological capacities as suggested by a functional-form model.

Growth rates of adult *E. intestinalis* and *P. littoralis* were significantly increased by enrichment with urea, ammonium, and nitrate, but no interspecific differences occurred. In addition, the two species did not differ in N and P assimilation over the experimental period. We therefore assume no preference or niche differentiation between the two species regarding the use of different nitrogen sources as reported for other macroalgae (DeBoer et al. 1978, Fujita et al. 1989, Floreto et al. 1996). In combined enrichment treatments, phosphate slightly increased growth in *Pilayella*, whereas

TABLE 2. Molar N:P ratios of media and algal tissue after 12 days of growth in treatments with single and combined enrichments with nitrate (500 μ M) and phosphate (30 μ M).

$\frac{\text{Treatment}}{\text{NO}_{\overline{3}}}$	Molar N:P ratio						
	Medium	E. intestinalis	P. littoralis				
	5000	41.32	46.98				
$NO_{\overline{3}}^{-}/PO_{4}^{-}$	16.6	20.71	24.57				
PO_4^-	0.1	12.18	11.55				
Control	43	22.13	23.13				



FIG. 3. Nutrient uptake of *Pilayella littoralis* and *Enteromorpha intestinalis* in relation to substrate concentration at different time intervals. Symbols follow increasing time interval (T, in minutes) in the order circle, square, triangle up, triangle down, diamond. Data of each time interval were fitted to Michaelis–Menten equation using nonlinear regression analyses (solid lines). For parameter estimation (V_{max} , K_m , α), see Table 3.

Enteromorpha remained unaffected. However, this difference as indicated by a significant phosphate \times species interaction explained only a small portion of total variance compared with the dominant nitrate effect, which did not differ among species (Table 1). Moreover, *Pilayella* did not reach higher maximal RGR than *Enteromorpha*. We further suggest that selective phosphate effects on *Pilayella* may not be ecologically relevant. During the main growing period of the two species in spring and summer, nitrogen limitation in the field (see below) overrides the phosphate effect, while in winter and early spring, temperature and light conditions are the main limiting factors for growth (Lotze et al. 1999).

The greater effect of N over P enrichment may indicate N limitation of growth (Björnsäter and Wheeler 1990). In summer, nitrogen concentrations at the field site were close to the detection limit, whereas phosphate was still available (Schramm et al. 1996). However, species may use nutrient pulses caused by frequent wind-driven water exchange with the inner, highly eutrophic Schlei Fjord (Schramm et al. 1996). Other potentially important nitrogen sources include nutrient recycling through the detritus food chain (Pregnall and Miller 1988, Lavery and McComb 1991, Hanisak 1993), herbivore excretion (Williams and Carpenter 1988), and nutrient flux from the sediment (Christiansen et al. 1992, Brennan and Wilson 1993). Tissue analyses of field plants indicated increasing N limitation with decreasing N:P ratios from 40 in spring to <20 in summer (Schramm et al. 1996). Prior to our experiments in June, N:P ratios were 19 and 21 for Pilayella and Enteromorpha, respectively. After 12 days of growth, unenriched (N:P = 43) and combined N- and

	Enteromorpha intestinalis						Pilayella littoralis					
Time (min)	V _{max}	SE	$K_{\rm m}$	SE	α	R^2	$V_{\rm max}$	SE	$K_{\rm m}$	SE	α	R^2
NO ₃ ⁻ uptake												
$0-30^{-1}$	237.3	30.3	43.7	18.5	5.4	0.64	300.1	43.4	116.4	45.9	2.6	0.77
30-60	172.8	24.0	26.9	13.4	6.4	0.56	166.5	16.0	54.5	17.1	3.1	0.65
60-120	135.7	17.6	21.4	10.3	6.3	0.51	65.8	1.5	19.9	1.8	3.3	0.50
120-180	90.1	4.2	20.4	3.7	4.4	0.49	33.6	2.5	5.2	1.9	6.5	0.37
NH ₄ ⁺ uptake												
$0-15^{1}$	439.1	33.7	66.4	16.3	6.6	0.67	466.7	43.2	66.6	19.1	7.0	0.67
15-30	286.9	20.1	37.7	9.6	7.6	0.58	351.4	56.2	42.3	22.9	8.3	0.60
30-45	156.0	15.9	17.7	7.6	8.8	0.47	257.5	51.8	53.1	34.9	4.9	0.64
45-60	107.5	6.3	13.3	3.5	8.1	0.42	181.6	27.3	58.2	28.5	3.1	0.66
60-120	60.7	5.5	12.8	5.4	4.7	0.41	52.6	8.1	10.1	6.6	5.2	0.40
PO₄ [−] uptake												
$0 - 60^{1}$	46.9	13.5	17.3	10.6	2.7	0.92	44.2	17.7	15.4	13.9	2.9	0.90
60-120	35.9	14.4	17.1	13.8	2.1	0.93	30.9	9.4	11.6	8.0	2.7	0.87
120-240	13.9	3.9	8.1	5.8	1.7	0.86	8.2	1.8	3.7	2.5	2.2	0.75

TABLE 3. Maximum uptake rate (V_{max} in μ mol·h⁻¹·g⁻¹ dry weight), half-saturation constant (K_{m} in μ M), initial slope ($\alpha = V_{\text{max}}/K_{\text{m}}$), and correlation coefficient (R^2) of nutrient uptake of *Pilayella littoralis* and *Enteromorpha intestinalis* at different time intervals.^a

^aData were fitted to the Michaelis–Menten equation using nonlinear least-squares regression. Shown are means of estimated kinetic parameters (± 1 SE, n = 7 for nitrate and ammonium, n = 5 for phosphate).

P-enriched (N:P = 17) treatments resulted in tissue N:P ratios of 21 to 25 in both species, which is close to a balanced internal N:P ratio (Björnsäter and Wheeler 1990). In contrast, tissue N:P ratios exceeded 40 in N-enriched treatments (N:P = 5000); this suggests P limitation comparable to the early spring situation in the field. Tissue N:P ratios around 12 in P-enriched treatments (N:P = 0.1) suggest N limitation comparable to the summer field situation. Our experimental plants thus seemed to be slightly N limited. Compared with Enteromorpha, P. littoralis had a greater N content. This indicates that Pilayella either assimilated more N in the field or had a greater storage capacity than Enteromorpha. However, N content of both Pilayella and *Enteromorpha* varied greatly during the vegetation period, with no clear patterns between the two species in the field (Schrammet al. 1996). We therefore assume that there is no clear advantage for *Pilayella* resulting from increased N assimilation or storage.

Similar growth responses of E. intestinalis and P. littoralis are corroborated by the results of our nutrient uptake studies. No distinct interspecific differences occurred in the uptake rates and kinetic parameters for nitrate, ammonium, and phosphate. Enteromorpha showed slightly higher nitrate uptake rates at later time intervals (60-120, 120-180 min). In contrast, Pilayella showed higher ammonium uptake rates at intermediate time intervals (30-45, 45-60 min). Since nitrogen pulses released from the sediment are mainly in the form of ammonium (Riisgard et al. 1995) there may be a slight net advantage for Pilayella. Furthermore, the greater initial tissue N content in Pilayella might have lowered its overall uptake rates, since there is a feedback between internal N pools (which reflect past nutritional history) and uptake rates (Fujita 1985, O'Brien and Wheeler 1987). However, the greater N content could also reflect a higher N demand or critical N content in *Pilayella* needed to sustain maximal uptake or growth rate (Fujita et al. 1989, Pedersen and Borum 1996). Importantly, these rather subtle differences did not result in better performance of one species in either our laboratory growth experiments or in field experiments (Lotze et al. 2000, Worm et al. 2000).

Strong time dependency of uptake rates was found for all nutrients tested and for both species. Initial uptake slopes (α) were highly variable and did not change consistently with time, paralleling results from Pedersen (1994) and Pedersen and Borum (1997). Surge uptake was much higher than assimilation uptake in all nutrients tested, which is advantageous in systems with episodic nutrient supply (Pedersen 1994, Pedersen and Borum 1997). Saturation of uptake in our experiments occurred at concentrations greater than reported in earlier studies on Enteromorpha and Pilayella (Harlin 1978, Kautsky 1982, Wallentinus 1984, Fujita 1985, O'Brien and Wheeler 1987). Both species may have adapted to rich nutrient conditions, accounting for their success in eutrophic waters. The decline of uptake rates at highest substrate concentrations suggests inhibition of algal performance at elevated nutrient levels. This has been reported from growth and uptake of Cladophora and Gracilaria at ammonium levels of 100 µM (20 times the maximum background level) (Peckol and Rivers 1995a). On the other hand, Enteromorpha and Ulva have not been depressed at enrichment levels of 840 µM nitrate, which is 56 times the background level (Fong et al. 1996). Depression or inhibition of algal performance under high-nutrient conditions may depend on nutrient type, nutrient concentration, and the degree of tolerance or adaptation to high nutrient levels. The concentrations we chose in our experiments were 4 to 12 times the maximum background levels at our site. These concentrations are realistic with respect to our and other eutrophic systems because (1) high winter concentrations in our system remain until March (Schramm et al. 1996), when annual algal growth is initiated (Lotze et al. 1999, 2000); (2) there is frequent wind-driven transport of nutrient-rich water from the

inner Schlei Fjord (maximum of 350 μ M nitrate N, 180 μ M ammonium N and 15 μ M phosphate P, Schramm et al. 1996); (3) nutrient levels released from the sediment can be very high (e.g. 1300 μ mol N·m⁻²·h⁻¹ in summer, Riisgard et al. 1995; see also Lohse et al. 1995, Jürgensen 1995, Watson and Frickers 1995); (4) increased land runoff after rainfalls can carry very high nutrient loads (Fong et al. 1996); and (5) nutrient levels within macroalgal mats or blooms are highly elevated compared with the surrounding water (Thybo-Christesen et al. 1993, Krause-Jensen et al. 1996).

Overall, we were surprised not to find distinct differences in physiological capacity of P. littoralis and E. intestinalis, given marked differences in their morphology. As a measurement of metabolically active area, the SA/V ratio was reported as from 1694 to 1737 in P. littoralis and from 369 to 529 in Enteromorpha sp. (Nielsen and Sand-Jensen 1990). Since Enteromorpha species vary greatly in their morphology, we determined the SA/V ratio for unbranched E. intestinalis as 140 (20 individuals measured). Thus, the SA/V ratio is at least 4 to 10 times greater in P. littoralis than E. intestinalis. A general correlation between SA/V ratio and uptake and growth rates has been found in comparing micro- to macroalgae and angiosperms (Nielsen and Sand-Jensen 1990, Hein et al. 1995), among different functional groups of macroalgae (Rosenberg and Ramus 1984, Duke et al. 1989), and different morphological forms of one genus (Gacia et al. 1996). A difference of 4 to 5 in the SA/V ratio can translate into distinct differences in uptake capacities (Rosenberg and Ramus 1984). On the other hand, 4-fold to 8-fold differences in the SA/V ratio did not result in different maximal growth rates among several filamentous and foliose species (Nielsen and Sand-Jensen 1990). Pedersen and Borum (1997) have reported a weak correlation of uptake capacity to SA/V ratio, with a range from 10 to 560. Combined with our findings, these contrasting results suggest that the SA/V ratio may not be very useful as a comparative index in predicting physiological capabilities for seaweed species co-occurring in a particular habitat, especially when these species belong to similar functional groups. Overlapping diffusion boundary layers may reduce uptake capacities in filamentous algae and thus reduce the advantage of a greater SA/V ratio (Hay 1981). A high SA/V ratio is only one of several morphological factors (such as small size, simple thallus structure, or undifferentiated cells which are all photosynthetic) that are believed to translate into higher physiological capacities, according to a functional-form model (Littler and Littler 1980). However, the physiological capacities of algae belonging to the filamentous (finely branched) and foliose (sheetlike) functional groups often seem to overlap (Wallentinus 1984, Nielsen and Sand-Jensen 1990, Pedersen 1995, Pedersen and Borum 1997). For productivity data, variation within the two groups was often greater than between groups, and maximum productivity levels were reached by either filamentous or foliose species, depending on the study and the parameter measured (Arnold and Murray 1980, Littler 1980, Littler and Arnold 1982, Littler et al. 1983). Very useful as conceptual model that outlines general trends in ecophysiological and ecological traits, the functional-group classification (as the SA/V ratio) seems less useful as a predictive model with regards to physiological differences among opportunistic species that form macroalgal blooms.

We conclude that the overwhelming dominance of P. littoralis over E. intestinalis in the field cannot be explained by interspecific physiological differences. Although strongly reactive to high nutrient loads, bloomforming macroalgae cannot be viewed as simple growth machines and are subject to complex ecological constraints. Lotze et al. (2000) showed that population dynamics and species distribution of Enteromorpha and Pilayella in the field were strongly controlled by different overwintering and recruitment strategies, as well as by selective herbivory. Both species suffer from high losses to grazing, but, as long as Enteromorpha is present, this species is preferred by herbivores which indirectly favors Pilayella (Lotze and Worm 2000). Nutrient enrichment in the field favors both algae in a similar fashion, with Pilayella dominating if grazers are present and Enteromor*pha* dominating if grazers are absent (Worm et al. 2000). Clearly, factors other than ecophysiological traits are indicated to explain and predict species distribution and dominance patterns in macroalgal blooms.

We greatly appreciate the comments and suggestions on the manuscript by B. Worm, A. R. O. Chapman, U. Sommer, A. F. Peters, T. B. H. Reusch, and two anonymous referees. This work was funded by the European Union (EUMAC, Contract no. EV5V-CT93-0290, with a grant to W. Schramm).

- Arnold, K. E. & Murray, S. N. 1980. Relationships between irradiance and photosynthesis for marine benthic green algae (Chlorophyta) of differing morphologies. *J. Exp. Mar. Biol. Ecol.* 43:183–92.
- Björnsäter, B. R. & Wheeler, P. A. 1990. Effect of nitrogen and phosphorus supply on growth and tissue composition of Ulva fenestra and Enteromorpha intestinalis (Ulvales, Chlorophyta). J. Phycol. 26:603–11.
- Bolton, J. J. 1979. Estuarine adaptation in populations of *Pilayella littoralis* (L.) Kjellm. (Phaeophyta, Ectocarpales). *Estuarine Coastal Mar. Sci.* 9:273–80.
- Bonsdorff, E. 1992. Drifting algae and zoobenthos—effects on settling and community structure. *Neth. J. Sea Res.* 30:57–62.
- Brennan, M. T. & Wilson, J. G. 1993. Nutrient exchange between the sediment and the overlying water on the intertidal mudflats of the Shannon estuary. *Arch. Hydrobiol.* 75:423–50.
- Carpenter, R. C. 1990. Competition among marine macroalgae: a physiological perspective. J. Phycol. 26:6–12.
- Cederwall, H. & Elmgren, R. 1990. Biological effects of eutrophication in the Baltic Sea, particularly the coastal zone. *Ambio* 19:109–12.
- Christiansen, C., Zacharias, I. & Vang, T. 1992. Storage, redistribution and net export of dissolved and sediment-bound nutrients, Vejle Fjord, Denmark. *Hydrobiologia* 235/236:47–57.
- DeBoer, J. A., Guigli, H. J., Israel, T. L. & D'Elia, C. F. 1978. Nutritional studies of two red algae. I. Growth rate as a function of nitrogen source and concentration. J. Phycol. 14:261–6.
- Duarte, C. M. 1995. Submerged aquatic vegetation in relation to different nutrient regimes. *Ophelia* 41:87–112.
- Duke, C. S., Litaker, W. & Ramus, J. 1989. Effects of temperature, nitrogen supply, and tissue nitrogen on ammonium uptake rates of the chlorophyte seaweeds *Ulva curvata* and *Codium decorticatum. J. Phycol.* 25:113–20.
- Fletcher, R. L. 1996. The occurrence of "green tides"—a review. In Schramm, W. & Nienhuis, P. H. [Eds.] Marine Benthic Vegeta-

tion—Recent Changes and the Effects of Eutrophication. Springer, Berlin, pp. 7–44.

- Floreto, E. A. T., Teshima, S. & Ishikawa, M. 1996. Effects of nitrogen and phosphorus on the growth and fatty acid composition of *Ulva pertusa* Kjellman (Chlorophyta). *Bot. Mar.* 39:69–74.
- Fong, P., Boyer, K. E., Desmond, J. S. & Zedler, J. B. 1996. Salinity stress, nitrogen competition, and facilitation: what controls seasonal succession of two opportunistic green macroalgae? *J. Exp. Mar. Biol. Ecol.* 206:203–21.
- Fujita, R. M. 1985. The role of nitrogen status in regulating transient ammonium uptake and nitrogen storage by macroalgae. *J. Exp. Mar. Biol. Ecol.* 92:283–301.
- Fujita, R. M., Wheeler, P. A. & Edwards, R. L. 1989. Assessment of macroalgal nitrogen limitation in a seasonal upwelling region. *Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser.* 53:293–303.
- Gacia, E., Littler, M. M. & Littler, D. S. 1996. The relationships between morphology and photosynthetic parameters within the polymorphic genus *Caulerpa. J. Exp. Mar. Biol. Ecol.* 204:209–24.
- Grasshoff, K., Ehrhardt, M. & Kremling, K. 1986. Methods of Seawater Analysis. Verlag Chemie, Weinheim, Germany, 419 pp.
- Hanisak, M. D. 1993. Nitrogen release from decomposing seaweeds: species and temperature effects. J. Appl. Phycol. 5:175–81.
- Harlin, M. M. 1978. Nitrate uptake by *Enteromorpha* spp. (Chlorophyceae): applications to aquaculture systems. *Aquaculture* 15:373–6.
- Harrison, P. J., Parslow, J. S. & Conway, H. L. 1989. Determination of nutrient uptake kinetic parameters: a comparison of methods. *Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser.* 52:301–12.
- Hay, M. E. 1981. The functional morphology of turf-forming seaweeds: persistence in stressful marine habitats. *Ecology* 62:739–50.
- Hein, M., Pedersen, M. F. & Sand-Jensen, K. 1995. Size-dependent nitrogen uptake in micro- and macroalgae. *Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser.* 118:247–53.
- Howell, D. C. 1992. Statistical Methods for Psychology. Duxbury Press, Belmont, California, 693 pp.
- Kautsky, L. 1982. Primary production and uptake kinetics of ammonium and phosphate by *Enteromorpha compressa* in an ammonium sulfate industry outlet area. *Aquat. Bot.* 12:23–40.
- Kiirikki, M. & Lehvo, A. 1997. Life strategies of filamentous algae in the northern Baltic proper. Sarsia 82:259–68.
- Krause-Jensen, D., McGlathery, K., Rysgaard, S. & Christensen, P. B. 1996. Production within dense mats of the filamentous macroalga *Chaetomorpha linum* in relation to light and nutrient availability. *Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser.* 134:207–16.
- Kruk-Dowgiallo, L. 1991. Long-term changes in the structure of underwater meadows of the Puck Lagoon. Acta Ichthyol. Piscator. 22:77–84.
- Jürgensen, C. 1995. Modelling of nutrient release from the sediment in a tidal inlet, Kertinge Nor, Funen, Denmark. *Ophelia* 42:163–78.
- Larsson, U., Elmgren, R. & Wulff, F. 1985. Eutrophication and the Baltic Sea: causes and consequences. *Ambio* 14:9–14.
- Lavery, P. S. & McComb, A. J. 1991. The nutritional ecophysiology of *Chaetomorpha linum* and *Ulva rigida* in Peel Inlet, Western Australia. *Bot. Mar.* 34:251–60.
- Littler, M. M. 1980. Morphological form and photosynthetic performances of marine macroalgae: tests of a functional/form hypothesis. *Bot. Mar.* 23:161–5.
- Littler, M. M. & Arnold, K. E. 1982. Primary productivity of marine macroalgal functional-form groups from Southwestern North America. J. Phycol. 18:307–11.
- Littler, M. M. & Littler, D. S. 1980. The evolution of thallus form and survival strategies in benthic marine macroalgae: field and laboratory tests of a functional form model. Am. Nat. 116:25–44.
- Littler, M. M., Littler, D. S. & Taylor, P. R. 1983. Evolutionary strategies in a tropical barrier reef system: functional-form groups of marine macroalgae. J. Phycol. 19:229–37.
- Lohse, L., Malschaert, J. F. P., Slomp, C. P., Helder, W. & Van-Raaphorst, W. 1995. Sediment-water fluxes of inorganic nitrogen compounds along the transport route of organic matter in the North Sea. *Ophelia* 41:173–97.
- Lotze, H. K. 1994. Phänologische und ökophysiologische Untersuchungen an Grünalgen im Wattenmeer. Thesis, Kiel University, Germany, 78 pp. 1998. Population Dynamics and Species Interactions in Macroalgal Blooms: Abiotic versus Biotic Control at Different Life-cycle Stages.

Dissertation, Kiel University, Germany. Ber. Inst. Meereskunde 303, 134 pp.

- Lotze, H. K., Schramm, W., Schories, D. & Worm, B. 1999. Control of macroalgal blooms at early developmental stages: *Pilayella littoralis* versus *Enteromorpha* spp. *Oecologia* 119:46–54.
- Lotze, H. K. & Worm, B. 2000. Variable and complementary effects of herbivores on different life stages of bloom-forming macroalgae. *Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser.* (in press).
- Lotze, H. K., Worm, B. & Sommer, U. 2000. Propagule banks, herbivory and nutrient supply control population development and dominance patterns in macroalgal blooms. *Oikos* 89:46–58.
- Nielsen, S. L. & Sand-Jensen, K. 1990. Allometric scaling of maximal photosynthetic growth rate to surface/volume ratio. *Lim*nol. Oceanogr. 35:177–81.
- Nixon, S. 1990. Marine eutrophication: a growing international problem. *Ambio* 19:101.
- Norkko, A. & Bonsdorff, E. 1996. Rapid zoobenthic community response to accumulations of drifting algae. *Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser.* 131:143–57.
- O'Brien, M. C. & Wheeler, P. A. 1987. Short term uptake of nutrients by *Enteromorpha prolifera* (Chlorophyceae). J. Phycol. 23:547–56.
- Peckol, P., DeMeo-Anderson, B., Rivers, J., Valiela, I., Maldonado, M. & Yates, J. 1994. Growth, nutrient uptake capacities and tissue constituents of the macroalgae *Cladophora vagabunda* and *Gracilaria tikvahiae* related to site-specific nitrogen loading rates. *Mar. Biol.* 121:175–85.
- Peckol, P. & Rivers, J. S. 1995a. Physiological responses of the opportunistic macroalgae *Cladophora vagabunda* (L.) van den Hoeg and *Gracilaria tikvahiae* (McLachlan) to environmental disturbance. J. Exp. Mar. Biol. Ecol. 190:1–16.
- 1995b. Competitive interactions between the opportunistic macroalgae *Cladophora vagabunda* (Chlorophyta) and *Gracilaria tikvahiae* (Rhodophyta) under eutrophic conditions. J. Phycol. 31:229–32.
- Pedersen, M. F. 1994. Transient ammonium uptake in the macroalga Ulva lactuca (Chlorophyta): nature, regulation, and the consequences for choice of measuring technique. J. Phycol. 30:980–6.
- 1995. Nitrogen limitation of photosynthesis and growth: comparison across aquatic plant communities in a Danish estuary. *Ophelia* 41:261–72.
- Pedersen, M. F. & Borum, J. 1997. Nutritional control of estuarine macroalgae: growth strategy and the balance between nitrogen requirements and uptake. *Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser.* 161:155–63.
- Pedersen, M. F. & Borum, J. 1996. Nutrient control of algal growth in estuarine waters. Nutrient limitation and the importance of nitrogen requirements and nitrogen storage among phytoplankton and species of macroalgae. *Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser.* 142:261–72.
- Pregnall, A. M. & Miller, S. L. 1988. Flux of ammonium from surfzone nearshore sediments in Nahant Bay, Massachusetts, USA in relation to free-living *Pilayella littoralis. Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser.* 50:161–7.
- Raffaelli, D., Hull, S. & Milne, H. 1989. Long-term changes in nutrients, weed mats and shorebirds in an estuarine system. *Cah. Biol. Mar.* 30:259–70.
- Raffaelli, D. G., Raven, J. & Poole, L. 1998. Ecological impact of macroalgal blooms. Oceanogr. Mar. Biol. Annu. Rev. 36:97–125.
- Reed, R. H. & Russell, G. 1979. Adaptation to salinity stress in populations of *Enteromorpha intestinalis* (L.) Link. *Estuarine Coastal Mar. Sci.* 8:251–8.
- Riisgard, H. U., Bondo-Christensen, P., Olesen, N. J., Petersen, J. K., Moller, M. M. & Andersen, P. 1995. Biological structure in a shallow cove (Kertinge Nor, Denmark)—control by benthic nutrient fluxes and suspension-feeding ascidians and jellyfish. *Ophelia* 41:329–44.
- Rosenberg, G. & Ramus, J. 1984. Uptake of inorganic nitrogen and seaweed surface area:volume ratios. *Aquat. Bot.* 19:73–96.
- Ryther, J. H. & Dunstan, W. M. 1971. Nitrogen, phosphorus, and eutrophication in the coastal marine environment. *Science* 171:1008–13.
- Sand-Jensen, K. & Borum, J. 1991. Interactions among phytoplankton, periphyton, and macrophytes in temperate freshwaters and estuaries. *Aquat. Bot.* 41:137–75.

- Schories, D., Albrecht, A. & Lotze, H. K. 1997. Historical changes and inventory of macroalgae from Königshafen Bay in the northern Wadden Sea. *Helgol. Meeresunters*, 51:321–41.
- Schramm, W., Lotze, H. K. & Schories, D. 1996. Eutrophication and macroalgal blooms in inshore waters of the German Baltic coast: the Schlei Fjord, a case study. *In* Rijstenbil, J. W., Kamermans, P. & Nienhuis, P. H. [Eds.] *EUMAC—Synthesis Report*. NIOO, Yerseke, The Netherlands, pp. 17–73.
- Schramm, W. & Nienhuis, P. H. 1996. Marine Benthic Vegetation— Recent Changes and the Effects of Eutrophication. Springer, Berlin, 470 pp.
- Thybo-Christesen, M., Rasmussen, M. B. & Blackburn, T. H. 1993. Nutrient fluxes and growth of *Cladophora sericea* in a shallow Danish bay. *Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser.* 100:273–81.

- Wallentinus, I. 1978. Productivity studies on Baltic macroalgae. Bot. Mar. 21:365–80.
- 1984. Comparisons of nutrient uptake rates for Baltic macroalgae with different thallus morphologies. *Mar. Biol.* 80:215–55.
- Watson, P. G. & Frickers, T. 1995. Sediment-water exchange of nutrients in the S. North Sea adjacent to the Humber Estuary. *Ophelia* 41:361–84.
- Williams, S. L. & Carpenter, R. C. 1988. Nitrogen-limited primary productivity of coral reef algal turfs: potential contribution of ammonium excreted by *Diadema antillarum. Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser.* 47:145–52.
- Worm, B., Lotze, H. K. & Sommer, U. 2000. Coastal food-web structure, carbon storage and nitrogen restoration regulated by consumer pressure and nutrient loading. *Limnol. Oceanogr.* 45:339–49.